

Minutes of the Third meeting of the Committee Chaired by Shri C.B. Paliwal, JS(E), DOPT on 13.11.2007 at 11.00 A.M.

The third meeting of the Committee constituted in compliance with the directions dated 17.4.2007 in W.P. No. 445/01 of Hon'ble High Court of Chhattisgarh at Bilaspur in the matter of Shri B.R. Godbole & Ors. Vs. Municipal Corporation, Durg was held on 13.11.2007 at 11.00 A.M. under the Chairmanship of Shri C.B. Paliwal, JS(E), DOPT in his chamber to discuss and decide the representations of State Government employee of erstwhile Madhya Pradesh.

The meeting was attended by the following :-

1. Shri Jawahar Shrivastava, Secretary, GAD, Chhattisgarh – Member
2. Shri Y. Satyam, Addl. Secy, GAD, MP - Member
3. Shri V. Peddanna, DS (SR), DOPT - Member

After welcoming the members of the Committee the Chairman desired the status of acceptance of the recommendation made by it in its second meeting held on 16.10.2007, by the Government. Shri Peddanna, Deputy Secretary (SR) informed that the file containing the recommendations of the Committee has already been submitted for acceptance by the Government. He also informed that the Govt. counsel at Bilaspur had been requested to seek extension of time upto 18.1.2008 for compliance of the directions of the

Mohamed S. L.

Hon'ble High Court. Shri Jawahar Srivastava, Secretary, Chhattisgarh Government also informed that he was in constant touch with the Govt. counsel with regard to extension of time from the court. Thereafter, the representations of the employees covered by the aforesaid direction of the Hon'ble Court were taken up for discussion & decision. The recommendation made by the Committee in respect of the 35 representations are indicated at Annexure.

In the end it was decided that the fourth meeting of the Committee would be held on 13.12.2007 at 11.00 AM

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Moham S D

Annexure to the minutes of the meeting held on 13.11.07

Sl. No.	Name of the Petitioner	Petition No.	Recommendations of the Committee
1	Suresh Kumar Varma Asstt. Gr.II	2208/03	Applicant wants to remain in Chhattisgarh. State allocation Chhattisgarh. With drawn his request for change in state allocation. No action is required.
2	A.R. Netam, Forest Range Officer	2474/02	Writ not related to State allocation. WP related to transfer of employee in Chhattisgarh. Employee himself admitted so. Hence no action is required.
3	Girdharilal Rai, Asst. Sub Inspector (Telecom) Technician	2889/03	Allocation on juniority basis as per guidelines. Domicile can't be basis for change in State allocation. No medical certificates submitted as far as illness is concerned. Hence claim may not be accepted
4	Harishankar Rai, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	Allocated on juniority basis, as per guidelines. Not recruited in OBC category but recruited as General Category. Hence allocated as general category. Hence claim may not be accepted.
5	Ram Prasad Bramhabhatta, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	Allocated on juniority basis as per guidelines. Seniors to him are also have been allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family matters can't become basis for change of state allocation. Hence claim may not be accepted.
6	Ram Ratan Sharma, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family matters can't become basis for change of state allocation. Hence claim may not be accepted.
7	Gokul Singh, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	Allocated on juniority basis as per guidelines. Seniors to him are also have been allocated on juniority basis. Hear problem occurred after 2 years of state allocation and hence can't become basis for change of state allocation. Hence claim may not be accepted.
8	Janakram Misra, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also have been allocated on juniority basis. No medical certificates produced regarding illness. Domicile can't become basis for change of state allocation. Hence claim may not be accepted.
9	Maharaj Singh, Head Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	State cadre employee. Allocated on juniority basis as per guidelines. Domicile

Mohinder Singh

			and family problem can't become basis for change of state allocation.
10	Ram Kishore Sharma, Asstt. Sub Inspector (Telecom)	2889/03	State cadre employee. Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also have been allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family problem can't become basis for change of state allocation.
11	Narendra Kumar Varma, Constable (Telecom)	2889/03	On the basis of comments of the department the petitioner had joined in MP on mutual transfer and hence no action is required.
12	Ravindra Kumar Guru, Constable (Machinist)	3496/03	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted.
13	Santosh Kumar Bhawarkar, Constable	3496/03	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted.
14	Nanku Singh Negi, Section Commander	4468/04	Allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family problem can't become basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted.
15	Umesh Kumar Mishra Asstt. Sub Inspector (Telecom)	82/04	Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family matters can't become basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted.
16	Girish Kumar Malviya, Asstt. Sub Inspector (Telecom)	82/04	Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family matters can't become basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted.
17	Gulab Das Banka, Constable (Telecom)	4637/04	Allocated on juniority basis. Seniors to him are also allocated on juniority basis. Domicile and family matters can't become basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted.
18	Smt. Priti Bathri, Sub Inspector	5434/05	Women employee. To be allocated as per option. Marries to a person domicile in MP. Claim may be accepted for change of state allocation from Chhattisgarh to MP.
19	Upendra Singh Yadav, Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted
20	Shiv Singh Kuswa Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted.

mishra

21	Amar Singh Baghel, Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted
22	Raghvendra Rajoriya, Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted
23	Ashish Kumar Tripathi, Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted
24	Bidhichand Sharma, Constable	3768/06	Non-state cadre employee. Working in Chhattisgarh at the time of bifurcation of the erstwhile state of MP. Hence request for transfer to MP may not be accepted
25	Hariram Yadav Constable	4475/06	Non-state cadre employee. The State of MP may consider the mutual application based on Chhattisgarh Govt's acceptance and pass the orders at the earliest.
26	Rakesh Kulshreshtha Sub Engineer	2488/02	Petitioner wants to remain in Chhattisgarh state as per his representation. Hence no action is required
27	Gopal Das Katria, Sub Engineer	2163/03	Allocated to Chhattisgarh on juniority basis. Option for MP and family problems can't be basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted
28	K.P. Koshta, Sub Divisional Officer	3724/03	State allocation Chhattisgarh. Wants to remain in Chhattisgarh as per his application. Hence no action is needed.
29	K.S. Mishra, Asstt. Engineer	3936/03	Allocated to Chhattisgarh. Wants to remain in Chhattisgarh as per his application. Hence no action is needed.
30	Prathish Kumar Bakshi, Sub Engineer	198/05	Allocated on juniority basis to Chhattisgarh. Department has clarified that as per the select list of 1989, the petitioner's seniority at 4644 is correct. Hence no case is made out for change of state allocation. Hence claim may not be accepted.
31	Vedprakash Mishra, Sub Engineer	6590/05	Allocated on juniority basis. No medical certificate submitted regarding illness of the applicant's son. Hence claim may not be accepted
32	Dr. Omeshwar Prasad Dubey, AMO	2186/03	On the basis of mental illness of the petitioner's father, which has been certified by the Doctor, the change of state allocation from Chhattisgarh to MP may be accepted
33	Dr. Umashankar Soni, AMO	2186/03	Allocation on juniority basis to Chhattisgarh. Domicile and family problems can't be the basis for change of state allocation. Claim may not be accepted

Mohandas Singh

34	Dr. Anwar Hussain Khan, AMO	2186/03	Based on gas compensation of more than Rs.50,000 to self and family members. Claim for change of the state allocation of the petitioner from Chhattisgarh to MP may be accepted
----	--------------------------------	---------	---

Mohinder

*a
Prak.*

above

P refe

The fourth meeting of the Committee was held on 13.12.2007 and representations of 43 employees were considered on case to case basis and decision in each case has been indicated below in the last column of the table:

Sl. No.	Name of the Petitioner Shri	Petition No.	Recommendations of the Committee (Pages 131-189/C)
1	Satish Bagdare, Lab Technician	1901/03	Already allocated to MP as per his request. No action is required.
2	Ramkumar Sharma, Asstt. Stat. Officer	2166/03	Retired on VRS, No action is required
3	Dr. Surya Prakash Upadhyaya, Asstt Vet.. Surgeon	4889/04	Already joined MP on mutual transfer basis. Relief has already been done. No action required.
7	Mohan Lal Sahu, Teacher	310/04	Non-State cadre employee. Working as per the Central Government guidelines. Hence no action is required.
8	Deenbandhu Verma, Supervisor	2904/03	-do-

9	Shambhu Prasad Mishra, Opthal. Asstt.	216/05	-do-
10	Rajgiri Goswami, Multipurpose Health worker	1741/05	-do-
11	Shankar Dayal Misra, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
12	Brij Kumar Tiwari, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
13	Sukhlal Singh Maravi, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
14	Kasi Prasad Viswakarma, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
15	Gulzar Prasad Varma, Asstt Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
16	Govind Prasad Duivedu Rev. Inspector ✓	197/02	-do-
17	Tejpratap Gupta, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
18	Long Singh Mahley, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
19	Ramayan Prasad Yadav, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
20	Laxman das Saket, Rev. Inspector ✓	197/02	-do-
21	Vijay Bahadur Singh, Asstt. Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
22	Ram Kelawan Singh, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
23	Ram Sewak Srivastava, Rev. Inspector	197/02	-do-
24	Shriniwas Gupta, Rev Inspector	197/02	-do-
25	Gajanan Prasad Gqutam, Rev Inspector	197/02	-do-
26	Ram Laloo Sharma, Rev Inspector	197/02	-do-
27	B.R. Godbole, Sanitary Inspector	445/01	Local body Non-state cadre employee appointed by local body which is not to be divided. Hence no action is required
28	Toran Prasad Sahu, Asst. Rev Inspector	446/01	-do-
29	Bhuvaneshwar Prasad Sahu, Asstt. Rev Inspector	499/01	-do-
30	Dilip Tiwari, Revenue Inspector	503/01	-do-

31	Angaru Singh Dhruv, Asst. Rev Inspector	583/01	-do-
32	Ildan Bada, Lineman	597/01	-do-
33	Heth Ram Sahu, Asstt. Rev Inspector	600/01	Local body Non-state cadre employee appointed by local body which is not divided. Hence no action is required
34	Heth Ram Patel, Asstt. Revenue Inspector	628/01	-do-
35	Vidya Prakash Sharma, Asst. Revenue Inspector	628/01	-do-
36	Sh Ganesh Das Manikpuri, LDC	628/01	-do-
37	Govind Ram Sahu Asstt. Rev Inspector	695/01	-do-
38	Himanshu Tiwari, Revenue Inspector	752/01	-do-
39	Kedram Sahu, Asstt. Gr.II	826/01	-do-
40	Vishnu Prasad Sharma, Executive Engineer	1482/01	Allotted to Chhattisgarh State as request of the applicant. Hence no required
41	Sh Rajiv Lochan Pandey, Chief Municipal Officer	920/02	-do-
42	Sh Sukhdeo Prasad Kariosia, Inspector	2263/01	Allocated to Chhattisgarh on junior Sh. Sitaram Chopra, junior to him allocated to MP on mutual trans. Hence recommended for rejection.
43	Sh Gopilal Bharati, Inspector	321/04	Allocated on juniority basis. T indicated in the application/repru can't become basis for change allocation. Hence recommet rejection

402/05(SA)/07-SAS
20/12/07

The fifth meeting of the Committee was held on 11.1.2008 and representations of 16 employees were considered on case to case basis and decision in each case has been indicated below in the last column of the table:

No. 41 / DS (SA) / 08-SRS
21/1/08

Sl. No.	Name of the Petitioner Shri	Petition No.	Recommendations of the Committee
1	Dr. Hardayal Goyal, Ayurved Medical Officer	298/04	Allocated to Chhatisgarh on juniority basis. No considerable points for change of allocation. Hence request may not be accepted.
2	R P Keshwani	2467/01	The case does not fall within the purview of the Committee because the employee is not state Government employee. Hence no decision of the Committee is required.
3	Smt K Maseeh Asstt.	2467/01	Not in the purview of the committee. Not a government employee. Hence no decision is required.
4	Devi Ram Kurmi, Asstt.Gr.III	2467/01	Not in the purview of the committee. Not a government employee. Hence no decision is required
5	Shri Rajendra Prasad Sharma, Paryavekshak	2874/06	Working in Chhattisgarh. Wants to stay back in Chhattisgarh. Govt. of M.P. has no objection to put him in Chhattisgarh. If he is not allocated to either of the States, he may be allocated to Chhattisgarh.

	Head Constable (Telecom)		Gwalior Manasik Arogyasala Psychatriest, on the basis of wife's mental illness, as per the guidelines, he may be allocated to Madhya Pradesh.
7	Govind Singh Sengar, Constable	3025/04	Already working in Madhya Pradesh. Petitioner's request <u>has been met</u> . No action is required.
8	Karan Singh, Constable	3025/04	Already working in Madhya Pradesh. Petitioner's request <u>has been met</u> . No action is required
9	Virendra Choubey, Constable	3025/04	Already working in Madhya Pradesh. Petitioner's request <u>has been met</u> . No action is required
10	Ratanlal, Constable	4637/04	Allocated on juniority basis. No considerable points for change of allocation. Hence request may be rejected
11	Rajesh Thakur, Constable	4815/04	Relieved to join in MP from Chhattisgarh. Request <u>has been met</u> . No action is required.
12	A.K. Nag, Tahsildar	2484/01	Allocated to Chhattisgarh by the Govt. of India. Request has been met. No action is required.
13	Rameswar Dayal Mourya, Inspector	320/04	Already working in Chhattisgarh. As per his request dated 7.12.07, he wants to continue in Chhattisgarh. Not willing to come to M.P. Hence no action is required.
14	M.R. Tirkey, Tahsildar	637/02	Allocation revised to Chhattisgarh by Govt. of India. Request has been met. No action is required.
15	Sriram Bhatti, Tahsildar	129/02	Allocated to Chhattisgarh. Request has been met. No action is required.
16	Kunwar Kujur, Asst. Superintendent Landrecords	912/01	Allocated to Chhattisgarh. Request has been met. No action is required.

Next and 6th meeting of the Committee is scheduled to be held on 08.02.2008 to considering the remaining pending representation of the 49 state Government employees. We may accept the recommendations (last column of pages 8-9/N) made by the Committee on the representations of petitioners and implement the same.

Submitted for kind approval of MOS(PP).

Mohinder Singh
(M.S. Sharma) 17/1/08
Under Secretary

~~DS(SR)~~

~~JSC AT, A/DLS)~~

~~Secy (P)~~

Deep
17/1/08

125/JS (A/SA) 2007
21/1/08

21.1.08